



TITLE:

<Book reviews> Itaru Ohta and Yntiso D. Gebre eds. Displacement Risks in Africa: Refugees, Resettlers, and Their Host Population. Kyoto: Kyoto University Press and Melbourne: Trans Pacific Press, 2005, 394p. +xv

AUTHOR(S):

Mamo, Hebo

CITATION:

Mamo, Hebo. <Book reviews> Itaru Ohta and Yntiso D. Gebre eds. Displacement Risks in Africa: Refugees, Resettlers, and Their Host Population. Kyoto: Kyoto University Press and Melbourne: Trans Pacific Press, 2005, 394p. +xv. アジア・アフリカ地域研究 2006, 6...

ISSUE DATE:

2006-08

URL:

<http://hdl.handle.net/2433/80063>

RIGHT:

それは著者も十分承知していることであるが、その一因が本書の視点が著者の意識以上に人類学的になっていることにもあるのではないかと思われる。著者は「人類学的研究であれば（中略）人びとが「在地の論理」に基づいてとる「主体的反応」にこだわり、地域の文脈に沿って微細な視点から世界を読み解こうとするだろう（中略）。だが本書では、むしろ「在地の論理」と「よそ者」（中略）との認識のずれや援助にともなう外部からの資源投入が、人びとの暮らしぶりをどのように変化させたのか、という点に課題を絞りたい」（p.290）として、人類学との差異を強調している。しかし著者の重視した課題も最近の人類学の重要課題といえる。長年イスラエルの研究をしてきた岸上伸啓は、都市イスラエルのコミュニティ形成運動に積極的に関与する中で「人類学とは何か」という疑問に突き当たり、「人類学的実践が、内部の視点と外部の視点とを併用しつつ微視的な視点からほかの人々の多様な生き方を長期の現地調査に基づいて理解し、記述することであることを強調しつつも、その実践そのものや調査結果の援用が現地の人々の生活を変化させる可能性があることを指摘した」[岸上2006: 520]。この岸上の人類学者としての自問は、本書の著者の開発経済学者としての悩みに通底するだろう。内と外の認識のずれを深く知ってしまった著者は、安易に理論化や政策提言ができない、あるいはすることを躊躇せざるを得ないのではないか。そうした悩み、ジレンマを突き抜けて理論化や提言が生まれたとき、著者の新しい開発経済学への貢

献がなされるだろう。

そもそも本書を人類学と経済学にわけて評価することは有益でない。本書が領域をこえて多くの読者に読まれることを願って筆をおきたい。

引用文献

- 岸上伸啓. 2006. 「都市イスラエルのコミュニティ形成運動—人類学的実践の限界と可能性」『文化人類学』70 (4): 505-527.
- 高橋 彰. 1965. 『中部ルソンの米作農村：カトリナン村の社会経済構造』アジア経済研究所.
- 玉置泰明. 2000. 「都市先住民の生存戦略—フィリピン・ルソン島南部アエタ (Acta) の薬売り」『静岡県立大学国際関係学部紀要』13: 109-130.
- 中西 徹. 1991. 『スラムの経済学：フィリピンにおける都市インフォーマル部門』東京大学出版会.
- ルイス, オスカー. 2003. 『貧困の文化—メキシコの〈5つの家族〉』高山智博・染谷臣道・宮本勝訳, 筑摩書房.
- Hill, P. 1986. *Development Economy on Trial: The Anthropological Case for Prosecution*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Itaru Ohta and Yntiso D. Gebre eds.
Displacement Risks in Africa: Refugees, Resettlers, and Their Host Population. Kyoto: Kyoto University Press and Melbourne: Trans Pacific Press, 2005, 394p. +xv.

MAMO Hebo*

Displacement Risks in Africa is an outcome

* Graduate School of Asian and African Area Studies, Kyoto University

of an international symposium held in Kyoto, Japan in November 2003. The symposium was organized by the Center for African Area Studies at Kyoto University and the COE (Center of Excellence) Program, “Making Regions: Proto Areas, Transformations and New Formations in Asia and Africa.” Displacement is one of the pressing problems Africa has been facing as the continent shares a disproportionate number of displaced peoples in the world. Displacement, thus, appears as a central concept of this volume. Risk is another central concept associated with displacements as being reflected virtually in all the chapters in the volume. The volume begins with a well-organized introduction in which the editors thoroughly discussed ‘conceptual’ issues of displacement risks. The eleven chapters in the volume are organized into three parts: ‘Refugees and Reintegration of Returnees,’ ‘Development-and-Conservation-Induced Displacements,’ and ‘Implication of Immigration for Host Populations.’

Chapter 1, ‘*No Solution in Sight: The Problem of Protracted Refugee Situations in Africa*’ by Jeff Crisp maintains that refugee situations in Africa have been protracted because of intricate vested interests of the various actors, and these vested interests have contributed either to the persistence of the conflicts that forced refugees to flee their countries of origin or slowed down their re-settlement and repatriation. Crisp argues that

different actors—donor agencies and refugee hosting countries as well—have contributed to the protracted refugee situations by focusing on repatriation of the refugees instead of integrating them in countries of asylum. Crisp suggest that international community and African states must give attention to ending conflicts that forced refugees to flee their countries of origin; promote voluntary repatriation, and explore alternative solution (integrating refugees into countries of asylum, for instance) and promote self-reliance of the refugees pending return, in order to deal with the protracted refugee situations in Africa.

Chapter 2, ‘*Coping with Displacement: Social Networking among Urban Refugees in an East African Context*’ by Roos Willems discusses how the refugees and other forced migrants from the Great Lakes region employed social networks as coping strategies in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. Willems reveals that discouraged by insecurity and poor health and living conditions in the refugee camps run by international organizations, increasing number of refugees made their ways to urban centers. Refugees made these decisions while they knew that international assistance is hardly obtainable in urban areas, and that they needed to ‘fend for themselves.’ Willems also reveals diverging views and misunderstandings between urban refugees and UNHCR officials in that, while refugees and asylum seekers predominantly

need the UN organization to provide them with protection and help them legally stay in Tanzania, UNHCR tends to perceive urban refugees as demanding and expensive to handle. Willems' analysis mainly focuses on the importance of social networking—outside of both international organization and asylum countries—for the survival and success of the urban refugees and asylum seekers.

In Chapter 3, *'The Uncertainties of the Child Soldier: Experiences and Subsequent Reintegration into Civil Societies,'* Art Hansen focuses on the integration of child soldiers into civil societies after the end of conflicts. Hansen begins his paper with conceptual discussions of 'civil' and 'military' societies. Hansen then argues that induced by war and conflicts, African societies are fragmented into civil and military societies, and these societies have different values and norms on which socialization and other forms of enculturation are based. These differences would have consequences in the process of reintegrating child soldiers into civil societies after the cessation of hostilities. Hansen discusses war time experiences of child soldiers and their post-conflict integration, and uncertainties that confront the communities into which child soldiers are to be integrated.

Chapter 4, *'Belonging, Displacement, and Repatriation of Refugees: Reflections on the Experiences of Eritrean Returnees,'* by Gaim Kibreab discusses Eritrean returnees' decision

either to return to their village of origin in Eritrea or somewhere else in the country or to stay on in a host country. Kibreab puts his discussion in the framework of two contending theories of belonging or the relationship between people and particular places: the theory of nationalism and liberal theories. Kibreab argues that belonging and places have no intrinsic value of themselves but instruments to fulfill a goal. Kibreab tends to put much emphasis on the social capital that people had built in refugee camps as a major factor that affects their decision on the place of return. Nevertheless, the case of Eritrean returnees couldn't tell us if there were some political forces that influenced returnees' decisions or if ecological and economic factors (absence or presence of land, for instance) influenced the decisions of the returnees, or if the returnees may later on look for a space in their place of origin once they established themselves somewhere else (for comparison see the case of Rwanda returnees in Chapter 5 of this volume).

In Chapter 5, *'Returnees in Their Homes: Land Problems in Rwanda after the Civil War,'* Shin'ichi Takeuchi and Jean Marara deal with the complexities involved in land acquisitions, and conflicts overland that followed the massive return of refugees after the end of a conflict that devastated Rwanda. Takeuchi and Marara based their discussion on comparative studies of two systematically

selected regions of Rwanda and focus on two cases of returnees: ‘Old Case returnees’ and ‘New Case returnees’—the former refer to those who fled the country in 1960s and the later refer to those who flee Rwanda in the mid-1990—and the interaction between the two categories. The interaction between the two categories of refugees was shaped around the land problem. The authors bring into fore the role of the government (or political actors) in channeling the interaction between the two categories of returnees. Takeuchi and Marara doubt about the stability of land rights obtained (by Old Case returnees) through political regime arguing that these rights are susceptible to inherent instability of the political regime. The authors also reveal that although ‘Old Case returnees’ initially returned and received land in the areas suggested by the government, they later on began to return to their place of origin and claimed land there too (p.183, compare with Kibreab’s arguments in Chapter 4).

In Chapter 6, ‘*Concept and Method: Applying the IRR Model in Africa to Resettlement and Poverty*,’ Michael M. Cernea deals with the IRR (Impoverishment Risks and Reconstruction) model, which he has developed to outline major social risks in forced displacement and ‘ways for counteracting them.’ Cernea’s analysis focuses on the studies that have successfully employed the IRR model in a various aspects

of displacement. Cernea argues that what his analysis unquestionably reveals is the link between forced displacements and the creation of ‘New Poverty.’ Cernea employs concepts of ‘Old Poverty’ and ‘New Poverty’ in the view that paradoxically, programs meant to bring about development (deal with ‘Old Poverty’) breed ‘New Poverty’ when they cause displacement—which exposes the displacees to the various impoverishment risks. Cernea alludes in his discussions that the IRR model, if properly used, could help avoid the creation of new poverty as it can help predict risks that displacement and resettlement programs would entail. Beyond its predictive value, Cernea maintains, the IRR model has diagnostic, problem solving and methodological functions.

Chapter 7, ‘*Some Socio-Economic Risks and Opportunities Relating to Dam-Induced Resettlement in Africa*,’ by Chris de Wet presents a summary of the various Dam-induced resettlement schemes from across Africa. He focuses on various kinds of risks and opportunities associated with Dam-induced resettlements, and argues that the success of resettlement projects be evaluated not merely in terms of its stated goals but by the latent opportunities such schemes may create—the opportunities that may result from the abilities of entrepreneurial members of both the resettlers and the host populations (pp.270-271). He maintains that

resettlement processes and the resettlers socio-cultural settings are inherently complex. As a result of this complexity, rigid and inflexible resettlement plans are risks-prone. Chris de Wet calls for an open-ended, dynamic, flexible and participatory approach in the processes of planning and implementing the resettlement schemes in order to deal with the complexities involved and promote resettlers' chances for a better adaptation.

In Chapter 8, '*The Environmental Risks of Conservation Related Displacements in Central Africa*,' Kai Schmidt-Soltau discusses nature conservation-induced displacements in Central Africa region. Schmidt-Soltau examines the various risks associated with the creation of conservation parks in the frame work of the IRR model and stresses that the hunter-gather communities who live in this region were not simply displaced but 'expelled' from their land. His arguments allude to a basic but fundamental question—conservation for whose sake or who benefits from the conservation efforts? Schmidt-Soltau argues that all the supposedly beneficiaries gained nothing, that the already abysmal poverty worsened (p.295), and resettlement processes contributed to the degradation of the ecosystems instead of conserving it (p.301).

In Chapter 9, '*Multiple Socio-Economic Relationships Improved between the Turkana and Refugees in Kakuma Area, Northwestern Kenya*,' Itaru Ohta examines, from the

'insider's' points of view, the interaction between the refugees (mainly of South Sudan origin) and their host—the pastoral Turkana of Northwestern Kenya. Ohta reveals that after some difficulties and uneasy relationship between the refugees and the Turkana during the earlier stage of refugees' arrival, the two groups eventually engaged in intermarriage, bond-friendship, and economic exchanges. Contrary to a general perception of the relationships between the refugees/settlers and their host population as heightened and conflict ridden, Ohta offers a new insight on the positive interaction between the refugees and the local population. He presents how the host community strategically made use of the presence of their 'guest population,' notwithstanding some fatal incidents and environmental problems exacerbated by the presences of a massive refugee population.

Chapter 10 by Eisei Kurimoto, '*Multi-dimensional Impact of Refugees and Settlers in the Gambela Region, Western Ethiopia*,' takes up that case of the Anywaa community in Gambela who were squeezed in between the expanding Nuer, the government-induced massive resettlement, and the war-induced refugees influx from South Sudan. Kurimoto outlines and discusses the environmental, economic, and political devastation and the heightened security in which the Anywaa found themselves. Kurimoto puts his discussion in a wider arena—political

instabilities and conflicts in Ethiopia and the Sudan—that further complicated the already delicate relations between the refugees/resettlers and the host population. Kurimoto outlines some fundamental factors that contributed to the scale of devastation: that the host population was neither consulted nor did they consented to the resettlers/refugees presence, that the number of refugees/resettlers was massive to the hosts, that refugees/resettlers were given a better privilege by the government and international organizations than the host, and that no forum was created for the refugees/resettlers to discuss and solve their problems with their hosts.

The final chapter by Yntiso D. Gebre, ‘*Promises and Predicaments of Resettlement in Ethiopia*’ focuses on Metekel resettlement in Northwestern Ethiopia and argues that the IRR model developed for the assessment of development-induced displacement could equally be useful to understand the risks to which the host populations are exposed. Subsequently, Gebre employs the model in a comparative perspective and outlines the risks to which both the resettlers and the host population were exposed, and adds the risk of insecurity or increased conflict to the tally of the risks developed by Cernea (Chapter 6). Gebre also compares the resettlement schemes of the 1980s to the current resettlement processes in Ethiopia. He argues that although

there have been some improvements in the manner the government is conducting the resettlement, there still persist the ambitious nature of the scheme and lack of feasibility studies of the scheme. Gebre calls for a more cautious approach in conducting resettlement. He stresses on the importance of conducting up to the standard feasibility studies and the need to deal with a reasonable number of people at a time instead of relocating massive population.

Displacement Risks in Africa provides a one-stop venue for displacement studies as it presents comprehensive resources on conceptual/analytical issues, provides case studies that encompass various forms of displacement, and brings into fore the effect of displacement on host communities, and the multidimensional interaction between the hosts and the refugees/resettlers. This volume deals with issues of urgency. It takes displacement as a central concept to reveal the gravity of the problem in Africa. It also discloses that the powerless (both economically and politically) are predisposed, to a larger extent, to the displacement risks, either as relocatees to make ways for development and conservation projects, or as hosts (their land being selected for resettlement sites or refugee camps), thereby disproportionately sharing risks of dispossessions and impoverishments. Powerlessness, thus, appears to be not

merely a risk but a fact that exposes the powerless to further risks. These powerless groups include ethnic minorities, the poor indigenous communities and marginalized pastoralists. Thoughtful studies presented in the volume appeal to the African governments and international organization not merely to have in place realistic plans and policy guidelines but also to follow them in the courses of resettlements schemes. This would help ease the creation of ‘new poverty,’ improve security, and reduce a number of impoverishment risks.

Ian Scoones. *Science, Agriculture and the Politics of Policy: The Case of Biotechnology in India*. New Delhi: Orient Longman Private Limited, 2006, 417p.

秋山晶子*

1. はじめに

遺伝子組み換え農作物は、貧困者の救世主となれるのか。バイオテクノロジー、特に遺伝子組み換え農作物（以下 GMO）は、先端科学技術による持続可能な農業というたい文句とともに、1990 年代のインドに導入された。本書は、自然環境および人体への悪影響といった不安定要素と、「最新の科学技術による明るい未来」という標語を併せもつこ

の科学技術を具体的な空間設定の中で徹底検証することを目的としている。舞台は、現代インド社会。特に情報技術産業（以下 IT 産業）と、それに続くバイオテクノロジー産業の発達で一躍有名になったバンガロールである。また分析方法としては、GMO の技術論を回避し、バンガロールを中心とした 300 件以上の聞き取り調査に依拠した社会科学的な実証研究をとる。

政策決定の場で GMO が、人々の語り、利害関係者の動向、政策力学の構造にいかん影響を与えているか、過去と現在を往来しつつ、変化と残像を描きだしているのである。そしてこういった描写をとおして、バイオテクノロジーは貧困緩和に寄与するか否か、という問いにたびたびもどるのである。以下では各章を概観したうえで、本書の特筆すべき点と批判を付け加えたい。

2. 各章の概要

1 章では、「緑の革命 (Green Revolution)」が終焉し、「遺伝子革命 (Gene Revolution)」時代の到来をみたインド、特にバンガロールを中心とするカルナータカ州の風景を描写することから始まる。資金と人的資源の投入規模が拡大したこの先端科学技術は、政府、民間、学術、市民団体を巻き込む複雑多岐なネットワークの中に存在している。序論となるこの章では、バイオテクノロジーが貧困緩和へ貢献するか否かという問題設定と、それを解きほぐすために政策決定のプロセスドキュメンテーションという方法を明言し、次章からの詳細な分析に入っていく準備として

* 京都大学大学院アジア・アフリカ地域研究研究科